

School Ethics Commission Meeting Public Session Minutes

April 26, 2022

Chairperson Robert Bender called the special meeting of the School Ethics Commission (Commission or SEC) to order at 9:42 a.m.

Notice of the special meeting was provided to the State House Press Corps and the Secretary of State, and filed as required by the Open Public Meetings Act.

I. Roll Call

Roll Call	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Present	X	X	X	X		X	5
Absent							1

Also, in attendance were Kathryn Whalen, Esquire, Director, Office of Legal Affairs and School Ethics; Jeannine Pizzigoni, staff member; and Jaclyn Frey and Hasib Haque, Deputy Attorneys General (DAsG). Everyone in attendance at the special meeting participated via telephone/video.

II. First Public Comment

At the start of the special meeting, Chairperson Bender explained to the public (who also accessed the special meeting by telephone/video) how the special meeting would be conducted. More specifically, Chairperson Bender explained that the public would be afforded the opportunity to provide public comment regarding his/her case; the Commission would then adjourn to executive session (on a different conference line); the Commission would return to public at approximately 12:00 p.m.; at that time, members of the public would be afforded another opportunity to provide public comment in connection with his/her case; and then the Commission would vote on matters pertinent to its business.

Director Whalen also advised the public as follows: individuals wishing to provide public comments/statements during First and Second Public Comment must be speaking about matters on the Commission's agenda; anyone wishing to provide public comments/statements about a matter not on the agenda should reserve their public comments/statements for New Business; anyone offering public comments/statements about a matter on the agenda is asked not to relitigate the merits of their case as the Commission's review of matters is limited to the written submissions; and everyone in attendance is asked to exercise an appropriate degree of decorum as this is a public forum.

9:45 a.m. Dr. Natakie Chestnut-Lee, Complainant in the matter docketed as C58-21, noted her attendance, but did not offer any public comments/statements.

9:45 a.m. Loreal Crisp, interested party in the matters docketed as C58-21, C71-20, and C35-21, noted her attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows.

“I'm calling in reference to a building up the standard that we're, we're, in a school district, we're in our district and we don't have our acting, our Acting Superintendent sitting in her seat which, which, is a disgrace for our students and our staff. And it's a discombobulation for our district. And, and wondering why she's not there. We're fighting to get her back in active duty to where she belongs. I mean, we need to see her face. We need to make sure that our students know who she is on a regular basis, not that they don't, but because they have yet to see her in a while, they haven't seen her since the beginning of the school district, the school season. I'm sorry. Then it, it, it brings a sense of discombobulation for them. We're still fighting to make sure that she is back in her seat and active. We're still fighting to make sure that our students become number one, students first, active voice and we have yet to give them that place. So I'm just here to state the, the fact that we don't have our Superintendent sitting in our seats, and to remind our State and those in the jurisdictions that we need to make sure that these things are known and that our students have a voice and are heard, and that they're necessities are put first. We're continuing to allow people to dictate to our district, what we should and what we should not do, which takes away from the strength, the structure and the overall stature and building of our community, our school district and our student body, which is, is suffering at the moment and struggling. So, I, I, want to just put on record that we need our Superintendent back in our seats and that she's done nothing but build the ethical source of our school district and bringing up our numbers, testing scores, and our students, our students. A background such as making sure that they know who, they who, who's serving them, who's in front of them, giving them an opportunity to speak, helping them to point out who's for them and who's here to fight for them and for their needs. We just wanna make sure that as a woman of our district, a woman, that she gets back into her seat and that we make sure that we're standing for her and not against her. She has yet to have a standing chance and that's the problem for me. So, there's what I wanna say and I'm, I'm, I'm, hoping that everyone really digs into the fact that she's not in her seat and that something else is going on behind the scenes. And I'm praying that she gets into back into her seat fully, fully before the end of the school season and, and, prayerfully, sooner than later. Thank you.”

9:51 a.m. Dr. Roderick Knox, Complainant in the matters docketed as C16-22 and C12-22, noted his attendance, and offered a statement summarized as follows:

“Good morning and hello to the Commission, the staff and all the participants are on this morning. My name is Dr. Roderick Knox and I have been wrongfully terminated from Pleasantville Public School.

As, as, referenced earlier, with the comment from someone earlier, they don't they know, they, can't, but I can really tell you what's going on. And as a result of not accepting what is wrong in Pleasantville, I have been terminated wrongfully. By not bowing to the threats of a foolish board president who is, who has an agenda. They don't include children's education or their future. I will not be moved until what is wrong has been made to be right. Pleasantville Public Schools and the children who attend these schools are victimized by some unethical board members, some not all, led by a non-ethical board president. Pleasantville Board

President, Jerome Page has been involved in illegal and unethical conduct, including bribes, sacrificing staff, threatening against employment of multiple staff members, intimidation of staff, discussing staff without proper[ly] Ricing them. He has engaged himself in retaliation, discrimination, creating a hostile workplace, abusing his oath as a board member, neglecting the needs of the kids, attempting to run the schools in the ground, violating the whistleblower laws, wrongful termination, unwarranted suspension threats and yelling in the crowded school full of kids. On an unauthorized visit, stating that he is a board member, threats and warnings to Superintendent to stay in her lane when she was simply doing her job, not allowing him to conduct day-to-day operations. I personally witnessed this and threats to me that if I don't listen to him, I will be terminated, and then following through on the threats, illegally and unethically. Displaying horrific misuse of authority as a board member.

The same has been done to the Superintendent, placing her on an unwarranted, baseless administrative leave because she would not cower under the attacks and manipulation of this tyrant. All to show he is in power and he runs Pleasantville School District. All, which is a violation of the Code of Ethics and the oath that he swore by.

He has ignored the, I've advisory opinions from you, the Ethics Commission, which would have kept him out of trouble, whereas he is not supposed to vote on anything to do with me or the Superintendent because of the ethic complaints filed against him. Page ignores legal advice from at least four different competent attorneys, warning him not to engage in voting when it comes to the Superintendent or myself. However, eager to prove that he doesn't have to listen to the Ethics Commission, nor any laws of the same, knowingly putting the district in harm's way without thought or remorse because the money he burns are monies for the children of Pleasantville, which is not his priority. He has proven he is incompetent by his actions and malicious by his perception.

I have five ethics complaints against Mr. Page, two of which are being heard today. I have two already at the Administrative Office of Law being heard, which I pray on. The others were sent there as well. I have an appeal with the Commissioner of Education, which will overturn the ignorance of Mr. Page and Jim Carroll, the Board attorney. It's just blind, leading the blind. The Superintendent has ethics complaints and, on Mr. Page. And his game, the assistant Superintendent, has ethics complaints on Mr. Page. Ten, ethic complaints in all. Everyone cannot be wrong. It is my hope that when this is all over, the Ethics Commission hold this tyrant accountable and that Jerome Page will never be able to be on anyone's board ever again, in the State of New Jersey for his continued abuse of his position as a board member. The Commission must kill this cancer in Pleasantville because it's choking the future from our kids every day that it continues to live. Our Superintendent, acting, Acting Superintendent is being compromised because she's bullied and she's intimidated by the President and the Vice President, we ask him and we're pleading, and we're praying that something is like, thank you for your time."

9:56 a.m. Leah Adams, parent of a Pleasantville student, and interested party in the matter docketed as C58-21, noted her attendance, and offered a statement summarized as follows:

“Good morning. OK. Thank you so much. I am responding to case number C58-21, in support of Dr. Natakie Chestnut Lee. It is imperative Dr. Chestnut Lee is returned as Superintendent of Pleasantville Public Schools. I am requesting this morning that this committee decided today to reinstate Dr. Chestnut Lee as Superintendent, immediately due to the violations bestowed upon her by certain Board of Education members in Pleasantville, that are in direct violation of ethical policies and in doing so, had, this has prevented her from doing the outstanding job as an effective and efficient leader as Superintendent of Pleasantville Public Schools. Dr. Chestnut Lee should be able to work until a decision is rendered by an administrative judge. No school districts should have to experience the malarkey and chaos that is presently occurring at Pleasantville Public Schools. Our children in Pleasantville should come first. Dr. Chestnut Lee is an effective leader that puts our children first, works in collaboration with staff and the Pleasantville Education Association, and has a true vision for Pleasantville public schools. Please reinstate her today to work. Our tax dollars are being wasted. Most importantly, I am also requesting this committee group all Pleasantville cases together to be heard by an administrative judge as soon as possible. Thank you for your time and have a good day.”

9:58 a.m. Michelle Taylor, parent of a Pleasantville student, and interested party in the matter docketed as C58-21, noted her attendance, and offered a statement summarized as follows:

“Hi, I'm Michelle Taylor, Pleasantville, and what the Board of Education is doing is not in the best interest of our students. They've put our Superintendent on leave without notice and without a reason. And we have, and, excuse me, it has gone completely downhill since October when she left. Our students are suffering and there's no structure in the district. The board cannot keep doing this to our kids. This is a reference to docket C58-21. Thank you.”

9:59 a.m. Tammy Williams, interested party in the matter docketed as C58-21, noted her attendance, and offered a statement summarized as follows:

“OK, I'm calling on behalf of the, the motion for Dr. Chestnut. Dr. Chestnut was put, put on notice after receiving excellent evaluations from her board members. Our district needs leadership. Dr. Chestnut has provided excellent resources and activities for our students. In her absence, none of these programs are being used. Dr. Chestnut Lee has our students' best interests at heart and we need her back immediately. Thank you.”

9:59 a.m. Regina Discenza, an interested member of the public, noted her attendance, and offered a statement summarized as follows:

“Hi, I just wanna say one thing. Now that I've been listening to the comments from Pleasantville a couple months ago, I actually drove down and attended one of their meetings and saw the chaos there for myself. That's all I have to say. There is absolute chaos at the Pleasantville School board.”

9:59 a.m. Alyssa Weinstein, counsel on behalf of Respondents in the matters docketed as C87-21 and C91-21, noted her attendance, but did not offer any public comments/statements.

10:01 a.m. Curtis Jackson, interested party in the matter docketed as C58-21, noted his attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows:

“Thank you. I would like to provide a comment on document number C58-21, regarding Dr. Chestnut-Lee. The president that is in place has done nothing but destroy the Pleasantville School District, and it's not increased or improving year by year. All that has happened is that there has been deals that have been made with criminals that have lied, as the President received favors in return. And because Dr. Natakie Chestnut-Lee has refused to turn a blind eye to corruption, the call for forensic audit, she was put on leave illegally since October of 2021. I would ask that the Commission would move swiftly and remove the board members, who refuse to put children first. Please reinstate Dr. Chestnut Lee.”

10:03 a.m. Judith Bassford, Complainant in the matter docketed as C96-21, noted her attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows:

“Hi, good morning. Thank you very much. I'm making a statement regarding C 96-21. My name is Judith Bassford. I am the complainant. I am speaking on my behalf and these are my personal views and opinions. I do not speak to represent the Clifton Board of Education in any way, shape or form. I submitted this ethics complaint after numerous violations and unethical behaviors that are clearly a conflict of interest which we are sworn into office not to do. Prior to filing the complaint, I attempted to handle these matters directly with the respondents, the Board President, the entire board, and the Superintendent with no resolve and rather than be a bystander to repetitive behaviors, as a responsible board member, I had no other option but to use this resource given by the State Ethics Commission.

Board of Education members are State elected officials that have the honor of serving their local districts. Each and every board member have a fiduciary obligation and ethical obligation to lead by example. An example that is set for the students, the entire staff and the taxpayers of Clifton and also the State of New Jersey when violation of the board of Ethics Commission occurs and continued to this day to occur, they need to be called out to the forefront. I serve as 11 board, 11- year board member, with every certification that New Jersey School boards can offer. Training is key for board members to know their roles and responsibilities. We are not trained to take matters into our own hands. We are trained as a collective whole to make, to be policymakers. We make decisions as a collective whole. Each board member is supplied the basic training on board governance. However, learning to be an effective board member never, ever stops. Each board member should be, should do, whatever they can to keep learning the rules, be present and not just show up for meetings. It is the perceived perception by the public that we represent that. Board members wear that hat 24/7 and everything we do or say is always connected to our board role. As I am a certified board member, a master board member, a certified board member, a board member. And it took me a lot to compose this ethics complaint due to the

repetitive behaviors that contain, continue with C96-21. I filed this complaint, pro se, with no cost to the district, but several times the respondent has used his comments to ridicule this process which is recorded on videotape and has told the public before a formal decision was rendered that these charges are frivolous. Once again, continue to, continuing to act above ethical standards that the Code of Ethics is based upon. He's made comments and used his position of power attempting to silence my right of process and to silence my voice. It is the perception that the respondent cannot reflect or use self-reflection. He cannot take accountability for his actions, comprehend the issue at hand, or blatantly, he just does not care. This is the sole reason the complaint was submitted. It is the continued behaviors to serve to dishonor members that take the Code of Ethics seriously and live them every day. The concern is that the respondent has and continues to use harm to the district, as previously actions have demonstrated. I would like to thank the New Jersey School Boards Commission for your time and your due diligence to wholeheartedly review the process and its entirety as it was designed for. Thank you very much.”

10:07 a.m. Howard Johnson, interested party in the matter docketed as C58-21, noted his attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows:

“I'm calling, this is Howard Johnson, calling in reference to docket C58-21. Uh, I've, I am an administrator in the school district of Pleasantville Public School and have been there for some of almost 15 years and when Dr. Natakia Chestnut-Lee was hired to lead the school district. I thought we were on our way in terms of doing what was best for the children of Pleasantville public schools. I'm not sure that the Board of Education is totally concerned about the educating, about children, and I'm, I'm, concerned about that. I'm concerned about the professionalism and I'm also concerned about the perception that has been out to the community in terms of our Board of Education and the energy that's put into educating our children and making sure that they meet the standards that they're supposed to meet.

I'm asking the Ethics Commission to reinstate Dr. Chestnut-Lee to lead the school district and do what it is that she indicated that she could do when she interviewed for the position and I felt that she was capable and I thought that we were on our way to a change and I think there's a change. That there's a change that needs to take place in Pleasantville public schools. And I'm willing, regardless of what role I'm in or what have you, that community is a part of me, and I want the children to get the best and I support her being reinstated today. Today. And let her do the job that we need done in Pleasantville public schools.”

10:10 a.m. Cassandra Clements, parent of children in the Pleasantville School District and interested party in the matter docketed as C58-21, noted her attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows:

“OK, my name is Cassandra Clements, and I am calling in as a parent of three children that attend Pleasantville School District. My oldest child is in high school. I've seen a lot of different superintendents in, you know, different leaderships throughout Pleasantville in these years and for me, I just wanna say that I support Dr. Chestnut-Lee coming back. So, if not for nothing else, just for

how she's helped me and my children, as well as other family members. I don't have to worry about if I'm going to get a call back. I don't have to worry about if I'm going to get an email back, if she doesn't have the answers. She goes and finds the answers, or she will direct me to where I can get those answers. Especially with, it's just frustrating because you see the district, you see that this made it, ... The district is in. I hear these children. I, I sit around with these children. I hear them, I hear their concerns, and I will be their voice, if, if they, if nobody else will. I will speak up for these children. And it just seems that, you know, there are some personal things that are going on and it's not about the children anymore, not for everybody, but for some. I'm not gonna say she does everything right, nor do I know she doesn't. But like I said, after going through the change of commands, once I get to her, it's always an answer whether it comes from her or somebody else. I agree with many other people that have already spoken about just the condition of Pleasantville School District as a whole. So again, as a parent, I'm just asking that we do what we need to do to get her back. And that's all I need to say."

10:13 a.m. Deborah Gordon, a community activist and interested party in the matter docketed as C58-21, noted her attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows:

"Yes, good morning. I'm sorry, I had a little difficulty in trying to get on. This is for docket C58-21 for Natakia Chestnut-Lee, our super, Superintendent of the Pleasantville School District. I am a taxpayer and I'm also a community activist and I have watched the Pleasantville School District for quite some time, and Dr. Chestnut-Lee has come into the school district after the school district has had several Interim Superintendents that were retired, that came in and band aid the situation. Dr. Chestnut-Lee came in with vision, ambition, education, finances to understand what the school district needed. She came in support of parents and students, teachers and staff members. And I am asking, for this board to have her not be in a place of leadership is a disgrace of dishonesty to our district and to our children and to this community. We need to have her back in place so that she can do the job that she was prescribed to do. She has done some wonderful things since being in the Pleasantville School District. She has set her foot on things that no one has done, and she has made some valuable decisions that was in direct help for these children of this district and the parents and the community members. And I am asking this board as of today to please reinstate her, to do the job that she was set to do. Thank you so much. Goodnight."

10:17 a.m. Kelly Moore, an interested party in the matter docketed as C58-21, noted her attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows:

"Thank you for allowing me to have this time to talk to you. Hello, this is Miss Moore. Thank you for hearing me today. I apologize. I was having a difficult time unmuting. I am here in reference to Dr. Chestnut-Lee and her reinstatement, her immediate reinstatement. Dr. Lee has proven that she can work with the city. She's worked with the State. She came in with an improvement plan to work on the conditions of the building and the safety of these children. She has brought up test grades. She has done an outstanding job. I feel like I'm in an episode of the Twilight Zone. She's been treated very unfairly. When she started to discover discrepancies and brought them to light, all of a sudden, she was suspended. I

think that is a horrible message to send to the community, as well as the children. When is this going to be about the children? What are we telling them? That if you work hard you get disciplined. If you tell the truth, you get disciplined. This is ridiculous. So, please this, this has to stop. Reinstate her immediately. Thank you.”

10:18 a.m. Matt Turner, an interested party in the matter docketed as C58-21, noted his attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows:

“Thank you for letting me have this time to talk to you. So, all the Commissioners, I need you to do me a quick favor. I need you to take a moment and think back on your childhood. You had no care. You had no worries. And most of all, you had no bills. However, this time you have been called to duty as the School Ethics Commission. I applaud you for taking this major responsibility. I'm quite sure that you all take this job very serious. So, I'm asking you, please, that it's time to make the right decisions in a timely matter. It's been a while, the last seven months. When it comes to the numerous ethics complaints against the President, the Board of Education members, I don't need to go over them. I think that everyone has explained what they have done or what they have not done. Please reinstate Dr. Natakia Chestnut-Lee so the children can, Pleasantville can be afforded the same childhood as you had. Your decisions will have a lifelong impact on the children in the city of Pleasantville for generations to come. I know things take time. I know they take time. It's the State. We don't have any more time. However, it's been seven months. The Pleasantville has had the properly the chip. I'm sure we can all agree to having the seat holder is not the same as having personal vested and seeing the success of the district at this present time, I think, and I'm quite sure when we agree, it's time to bring in, the State monitor back in. I think that can rectify and maybe set the ship upright and get things going cause at this present on the time the school is running amuck. Parents are pulling kids out. Teachers need to get in line, students, the other thing's amazing, all the stuff happening right after she was put out on administrative leave. So, I'm just asking and begging you prayerfully. Hopefully you guys gonna come to some type of decision today and get her reinstated. Thank you very much for your time.”

10:21 a.m. Julio Sanchez, a Pleasantville School District Board of Education member and an interested party in the matter docketed as C58-21, noted his attendance and offered a statement summarized as follows:

“Hi, my name is Julio Sanchez. At the time, Dr. Chestnut-Lee, at least the suspension, I was Board President. I am still a current Board member. There's so many things that are wrong with her being suspended. I kind of don't know where to start. I'll go back to when she was initially suspended. There was a group of Board members that got together and decided outside of the Board setting that she should be suspended with no knowledge of mine or the then Vice President. When I refused to illegally suspend her, or participate in illegal suspension of her, or without her being properly Rice'd, they staged a coup, tried to overturn me as the President and suspend her anyway, even though she had not been Rice'd. We had a then Board solicitor warn them that what they were doing was illegal and improper. They are. The answer was to proceed with doing it anyway and to terminate him [the Board solicitor]. We then replaced a him by vote, with another

Board solicitor, who's from a different law firm, who also told them that what they were doing was improper and illegal, so they fired her. Finally, they rested on Board solicitor we currently have, who refuses to abide by 18A, in, in the, the, State statute, and you know, kind of told them they were proper and suspending her. The initial suspension came when a former Board member who was a convicted felon, was removed for accepting bribes about 14 years ago from the Board, was calling me, telling me to put him in contact with Dr. Chestnut-Lee because he wanted to advise her on who to hire and who not to hire. When she refused to meet with him and allow him to control her decisions within the district, he decided that he would go, he would move to try to have the Board members that are friendly with him, remove her or fire her. He went about this by somehow, from what I was told, illegally obtaining her application of employment, in starting this investigation that the, that those rogue Board members put in place or requested it. Come to find out months later, she's suspended based on her appointment application supposedly, and the employment application doesn't even exist. They admit that they don't even know where the employment application is, they've never seen it. They just suspended her based on what? Mr. Pressley, who has nothing to do with the Board and again, is a disgrace, removed Board member said. This is, I'm, I'm, I'm, completely embarrassed about what's going on with the Pleasantville School District, as a member, and they really need you guys to step in. I think this is probably like the third ethics complaint that we've had from an employee in the district where I've come on and asked you guys. I know you gotta go through the process, but we need immediate help. It is no coincidence that the very date they decided to suspend Dr. Chestnut-Lee was the first meeting we were without a State monitor, because they knew the State monitor in place would not have supported an illegal act like that and immediately upon the State removing our fiscal monitor, the, the, very next meeting is suspended Dr. Chestnut-Lee.

They started a coup to try to overthrow the President or get rid of the President, and from then on, they suspended another member of her administration and they're kind of just looking to undo everything that she had done and it's all personal. It all started with some ousted board member, who is a convicted felon, who wasn't getting the attention that he thought he deserved from her. So, I, I will hope you guys will please, please act swiftly. You guys have numerous ethic complaints before you. I can tell you that they're all justified. They're true and I know as a Board member I'm supposed to protect the integrity of the district, but I'm also a parent of a student in, in, in, district and that comes first, and right now our district is being obliterated by selfish politicians and people who have alliances with outside of the district. And like I said, we really need you guys to step in like ASAP."

10:26 a.m. Director Whalen offered a statement summarized as follows:

"Alright, before I turn this meeting back over to the Chair, I just wanted to address something on behalf of the Commission. Many of you have made a request or a plea asking for the Commission to reinstate Dr. Chestnut-Lee, and while we're sensitive to the request, we need you to understand that reinstatement of a district employee is not within the jurisdiction of the School Ethics

Commission. There are means that, that can happen, but it's not through this office. But we thank you all for your comments.”

III. Executive Session

At **10:28 a.m.**, the following **Resolution** was read:

Whereas, the Open Public Meetings Act (*N.J.S.A. 10:4-6 et seq.*) authorizes the Commission, a public body, to meet in Executive Session under certain circumstances; and

Whereas, the Open Public Meetings Act requires that the Commission adopt a Resolution at a public meeting to go into Executive Session; and

Now therefore be it resolved that, consistent with the provisions of *N.J.A.C. 10:4-12(b)*, the Commission will adjourn to executive session to discuss matters which, by statute, are regarded as confidential and also to discuss matters possibly involving litigation, specifically: C66-18; C29-21; C47-21; C58-21; C66-21; C70-21; C75-21; C82-21; C91-21; C96-21; C13-22; C16-22; T06-21 through T33-21; C36-21; C55-21; C57-21; C59-21; C76-21; C85-21; C87-21; C90-21; C94-21; C07-22; C12-22; A05-22; A06-22; A07-22; A08-22; C01-22; C08-22; DAG Hasib Haque to provide a status update in connection with C23-21; Chairperson to select nominating committee (3 persons) to select nominee for the position of SEC Chairperson for the term of July 1, 2022 through June 30, 2023; discussion of potential 2023 SEC meeting dates; adoption of Resolution of Suspension in connection with T18-21; and update on the status of Chapter 28 regulations; and

Now therefore be it further resolved that the Commission will return to open session to conduct business at the conclusion of Executive Session.

Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Jude A. Tanella, to adjourn to Executive Session to discuss the matters set forth in the foregoing Resolution.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

IV. Return to Public/Second Public Comment

At **12:38 p.m.**, a motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to return to public session for the purpose of receiving public comment/testimony, and to vote on matters discussed in Executive Session (as appropriate).

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

12:40 p.m. Dr. Roderick Knox, Complainant in the matters docketed as C12-22 and C16-22, again noted his attendance, and offered the following additional statement:

“OK, this is a Dr. Knox. I just want to add to my statement earlier. I know it's within the, it's a process, and I'm very familiar with the process. I just would add that within the scope of the powers of the Commission, if it is, with all the complaints toward one person that's coming from out of Pleasantville, is it possible that we can ensure that all of those complaints be heard maybe by one administrative law judge or, you know, just lumped together, that, that's the only thing I want to add it. Thank you.”

12:42 p.m. Matt Turner, an interested party in the matter docketed as C58-21, again noted his attendance, and offered the following additional statement:

“OK. I wanna add on my statement from earlier, this is Matt Turner in reference to the State monitors. I'm aware that you guys, the, as the Commission doesn't hold the authority to reinstate the Superintendent, but what authority, or are you able to contact, write letters, do something to have the monitors come back in? Because, I think that's the only way it is, this problem's going to be alleviated and I would, I would really appreciate if the chair can answer that question for me.”

Director Whalen informed Mr. Turner that at the conclusion of the meeting, she would address his question regarding the scope of the Commission's authority.

V. Complaints to Review

C66-18 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C29-21 Motion was made by Richard Tomko, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C47-21 Motion was made by Michael Carucci, and seconded by Dennis Roberts, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C58-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C66-21 Motion was made by Michael Carucci, and seconded by Dennis Roberts, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C70-21 Motion was made by Richard Tomko, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C75-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C82-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C91-21 Motion was made by Michael Carucci, and seconded by Dennis Roberts, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C96-21 Motion was made by Michael Carucci, and seconded by Dennis Roberts, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C13-22 Motion was made by Michael Carucci, and seconded by Dennis Roberts, to draft a letter decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

C16-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Richard Tomko, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

Orders to Show Cause

Training – Board of Education Members

T06-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T07-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T08-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T09-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T10-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T11-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T12-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T13-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T14-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T15-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T16-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T17-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T18-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T19-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T20-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T21-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T22-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T23-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T24-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T25-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T26-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T27-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T28-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T29-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T30-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T31-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T32-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

T33-21 Motion was made by Mark Finkelstein, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the Order to Show Cause and to mail.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

VI. Decisions to Adopt as Written

C36-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

C55-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

C57-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

C59-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

C76-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as amended.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

C85-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as amended.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

C87-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

C90-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

C94-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as amended.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

C07-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

C12-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the decision as amended.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

VII. Advisory Opinions

A05-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the advisory opinion as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

A06-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the advisory opinion as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

A07-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the advisory opinion as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

A08-22 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Michael Carucci, to adopt the advisory opinion as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

VIII. Administrative Dismissals

C01-22 This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

C08-22 This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

IX. Other Business

DAG Hasib Haque to provide a status update in connection with C23-21. This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

Chairperson to select nominating committee (3 persons) to select a nominee for the position of SEC Chairperson for the term of July 1, 2022 through June 30, 2023. Chairperson Bender nominated Commissioners Mark Finkelstein, Dennis Roberts, and Richard Tomko.

Discussion of potential 2023 SEC meeting dates/times. This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

Adoption of Resolution of Suspension in connection with T18-21. Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein to adopt the Resolution as written.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

Update on the status of Chapter 28 regulations. This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

X. Minutes

Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adopt the minutes of the regularly scheduled meeting (public and executive) conducted on March 22, 2022.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X			4
No							0
Abstention						X	1

XII. Adjournment

At 12:54 p.m., a motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Mark Finkelstein, to adjourn.

Vote

Vote	Robert Bender	Michael Carucci	Mark Finkelstein	Dennis Roberts	Jude A. Tanella	Richard Tomko	Total
Yes	X	X	X	X		X	5
No							0
Abstention							0

Submitted by:

Jeannine Pizzigoni

Approved by:

Kathryn A. Whalen, Esq.
Director, School Ethics Commission